

1 PILLSBURY WINTHROP SHAW PITTMAN LLP  
2 BRUCE A. ERICSON #76342  
3 DAVID L. ANDERSON #149604  
4 JACOB R. SORENSEN #209134  
5 MARC H. AXELBAUM #209855  
6 DANIEL J. RICHERT #232208  
7 50 Fremont Street  
8 Post Office Box 7880  
9 San Francisco, CA 94120-7880  
10 Telephone: (415) 983-1000  
11 Facsimile: (415) 983-1200

7 SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP  
8 DAVID W. CARPENTER (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
9 DAVID LEE LAWSON (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
10 BRADFORD A. BERENSON (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
EDWARD R. McNICHOLAS (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
ERIC A. SHUMSKY #206124  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
11 Telephone: (202) 736-8010

<sup>13</sup> Attorneys for the AT&T and Cingular Defendants

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

18 In re:  
19 NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY  
TELECOMMUNICATIONS RECORDS  
LITIGATION

MDL Dkt. No. 06-1791-VRW

**STIPULATION AND [PROPOSED]  
ORDER TO EXTEND TIME FOR AT&T  
AND CINGULAR DEFENDANTS TO  
RESPOND TO COMPLAINTS**

This Document Relates To:

[Civil L.R. 6-2, 7-1(5), 7-12]

23       *United States v. Rabner*, No. 07-1324;  
24       *United States v. Palermino*, No. 07-1326; and,  
      *United States v. Volz*, No. 07-1396.

Courtroom: 6, 17th Floor  
Judge: Hon. Vaughn R. Walker

25

26

27

28

**Stipulation and [Proposed] Order to Extend Time  
for AT&T and Cingular Defendants  
to Respond to Complaints  
MDL No. 06-1791-VRW**

## RECITALS

2           A.       On February 21, 2007, the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation ordered  
3       the transfer of *Clayton v. AT&T Communications of the Southwest, Inc.*, No. 07-1187;  
4       *United States v. Gaw*, No. 07-1242; *United States v. Rabner*, No. 07-1324; *United States v.*  
5       *Palermino*, No. 07-1326; *United States v. Volz*, No. 07-1396; and *United States v. Adams*,  
6       No. 07-1323 (the “Federal-State Cases”) to this Court’s docket. Dkt. 173.

7 B. On March 30, 2007, the Court ordered that the AT&T and Cingular  
8 Defendants (as defined in footnote 3 of the Joint Case Management Statement, Dkt. 61-1)  
9 “need not answer or otherwise respond to the complaints in *United States v. Rabner*, No.  
10 07-1324; *United States v. Palermino*, No. 07-1326; and *United States v. Volz*, No. 07-1396  
11 until sixty days after this Court issues an order resolving the dispositive motions set for  
12 hearing by the Order of March 26, 2007.” Dkt. 224. The Court heard those motions on  
13 June 21, 2007.

14 C. On July 24, 2007, the Court denied without prejudice the United States'  
15 motions for summary judgment and denied as moot the State Defendants' motions. The  
16 Court further ordered that "[a]fter the Ninth Circuit issues an order in *Hepting*, the parties  
17 may renote their cross motions." Dkt. 334.

18 D. Judicial and party economy is best served by deferring the AT&T and  
19 Cingular Defendants' obligation to respond to the complaints in *Rabner*; *Palermino*; and  
20 *Volz* until after the Ninth Circuit has provided further guidance and this Court has  
21 considered and resolved with prejudice any renewal of the cross motions originally heard  
22 on June 21, 2007.

## **STIPULATION**

24 The United States and the AT&T and Cingular Defendants hereby stipulate that the  
25 AT&T and Cingular Defendants need not answer or otherwise respond to the complaints in  
26 *Rabner*; *Palermino*; and *Volz* until 60 days after the resolution with prejudice of the renewal  
27 of the cross motions originally heard on June 21, 2007, which the parties anticipate will

1 occur after the final adjudication of all appeals of the July 20, 2006 Order in *Hepting, et al.*  
2 v. AT&T Corp., et al., No. 06-672-VRW, including disposition of any petition for certiorari  
3 and, if granted, any resulting appeal to the United States Supreme Court (“*Hepting*  
4 Appeals”). In the event that no cross-motion is renewed within 90 days after such final  
5 adjudication of the *Hepting* Appeals, then the AT&T and Cingular Defendants will answer  
6 or otherwise respond to the complaints in *Rabner*; *Palermino*; and *Volz* within 120 days  
7 after such final adjudication of the *Hepting* Appeals.

8 Dated: August 14, 2007.

9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
PILLSBURY WINTHROP SHAW PITTMAN LLP  
BRUCE A. ERICSON  
DAVID L. ANDERSON  
JACOB R. SORENSEN  
MARC H. AXELBAUM  
DANIEL J. RICHERT  
50 Fremont Street  
Post Office Box 7880  
San Francisco, CA 94120-7880

14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP  
DAVID W. CARPENTER  
DAVID L. LAWSON  
BRADFORD A. BERENSON  
EDWARD R. McNICHOLAS  
1501 K Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005

20  
21 By \_\_\_\_\_ /s/ Marc H. Axelbaum  
22 Marc H. Axelbaum

23 Attorneys for the AT&T and Cingular Defendants

24 //

25 //

26 //

27 //

28 //

1                   **DECLARATION PURSUANT TO GENERAL ORDER 45, § X.B**

2                   I, MARC H. AXELBAUM, hereby declare pursuant to General Order 45, § X.B,  
3                   that I have obtained the concurrence in the filing of this document from the other signatory  
4                   listed below.

5                   I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing declaration is true and correct.

6                   Executed on August 14, 2007, at San Francisco, California.

7                   \_\_\_\_\_  
8                   /s/ Marc H. Axelbaum

                  Marc H. Axelbaum

9                   Dated: August 14, 2007.

10                  PETER D. KEISLER  
11                  Assistant Attorney General, Civil Division

12                  CARL J. NICHOLS

13                  Deputy Assistant Attorney General

14                  DOUGLAS N. LETTER

15                  Terrorism Litigation Counsel

16                  JOSEPH H. HUNT

17                  Director, Federal Programs Branch

18                  ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO

19                  Special Litigation Counsel

20                  ANDREW H. TANNENBAUM

21                  Trial Attorney

22                  ALEXANDER HAAS

23                  Trial Attorney

24                  U.S. Department of Justice

25                  Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch

26                  20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.

27                  Room 6102

28                  Washington, DC 20001

29                  Telephone: (202) 514-4782

30                  Fax: (202) 616-8460

31                  Email: tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov

32                  By \_\_\_\_\_ /s/ Alexander Haas

33                  Alexander Haas

34                  Attorneys for United States of America

35

36

37

38

## [PROPOSED] ORDER

Pursuant to the foregoing Stipulation, and good cause appearing, IT IS HEREBY

### 3 ORDERED that:

4 The AT&T and Cingular Defendants need not answer or otherwise respond to the  
5 complaints in *United States v. Rabner*, No. 07-1324; *United States v. Palermino*, No. 07-  
6 1326; and *United States v. Volz*, No. 07-1396 until 60 days after the resolution with  
7 prejudice of the renewal of the cross motions originally heard on June 21, 2007, which the  
8 parties anticipate will occur after the final adjudication of all appeals of the July 20, 2006  
9 Order in *Hepting, et al. v. AT&T Corp., et al.*, No. 06-672-VRW, including disposition of  
10 any petition for certiorari to the United States Supreme Court (“*Hepting Appeals*”).

11           In the event that no cross-motion is renewed within 90 days after such final  
12          adjudication of the *Hepting* Appeals, then the AT&T and Cingular Defendants will answer  
13          or otherwise respond to the complaints in *Rabner*; *Palermino*; and *Volz* within 120 days  
14          after such final adjudication of the *Hepting* Appeals.

**PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

16 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_, 2007.

Hon. Vaughn R. Walker  
United States District Chief Judge